

DRAFT MINUTES

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY
09/16/2020

COUNCIL CHAMBERS
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE
5:00 P.M.

1. Call to Order

Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 5:01 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Commission Members may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

DAVID HAYWARD, Chair - PRESENT
JERRY MCLAUGHLIN, Vice Chair - PRESENT
HARRIS ABERNATHY - PRESENT
EMILY DALE - PRESENT

JILL HOUGH - PRESENT
CAITLIN KELLY - ABSENT
CHARLES WEBBER - ABSENT

CITY STAFF PRESENT:

Sara Dechter, Comprehensive and Neighborhood Planning Manager
Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Office/Neighborhood Planner
Christina Rubalcava, Senior Assistance City Attorney

3. Public Comment

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

Lisa Clark, Community Steward Assistant, addressed the Commission with information about outreach from the Climate Emergency Declaration.

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes From:** Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting on August 19, 2020.

Moved by Commissioner Jill Hough, **seconded by** Vice Chairperson Jerry McLaughlin to approve the minutes of August 19, 2020.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

5. **PUBLIC HEARING**

- A. PZ-20-00107- Reconsideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for 608 W Aspen Ave. and Possible Public Hearing

Address:	608 W Aspen Ave
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-16-002
Property Owner:	Joel Agena
Applicant:	Anne Soper, NCARB , owner representative
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, AICP, NCARB

Moved by Vice Chairperson Jerry McLaughlin, **seconded by** Commissioner Jill Hough to reconsider a certificate of appropriateness for 608 Aspen Ave and open the public hearing.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

Chairperson Hayward opened a public hearing for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 608 W Aspen Avenue's application.

Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer, gave a presentation reviewing the findings and recommendations from the staff report.

Anne Soper, owner representative, stated she was available for questions but did not have presentation.

Public Comment was heard from:

- Duffie Westheimer
- Charlie Silver
- Armando Bernasconi

Written comments were read aloud by Sara Dechter from:

- Ellen Ryan
- Monika Bentley
- Jon Schulman
- Jen Blue
- Rick Moore
- Rose Houk
- Roabie Johnson
- Gerret van Hylckama

General discussion of ambiguities in the Townsite Overlay standards and guidelines, whether or not an Accessory Dwelling Unit Could be permitted on the property, whether expanding a non conforming structures footprint is appropriate, the appropriateness of the architectural elements, style, bulk, mass, scale and size. The Commissioners gave initial indications of how they wanted to vote in this case.

Moved by Vice Chairperson Jerry McLaughlin, to deny the application. Motion failed for lack of a second.

Chairperson Hayward asked if there was a second.

Commissioner Dale asked to understand if a denial would prevent the applicant from coming back with a new design.

Sara Dechter responded that the applicant could bring a new design in the following month.

Chairperson Hayward asked if there was a second. No second.

Moved by Chairperson David Hayward, **seconded by** Vice Chairperson Jerry McLaughlin to approve Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. the windows on the front facade are double hung
2. all new siding will be lap siding

Discussion continued that the motion lacked any mention of the roof slope and the size of the addition. Chairperson Hayward asked if anyone would like to craft an amendment to address that concern.

Moved by Commissioner Jill Hough, **seconded by** Chairperson David Hayward to amend the motion to approve with conditions to include an additional condition that the height of the addition should be lower than the height of the existing building.

Discussion continued to clarify the motion.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

Final Discussion seeking clarification if the commission needed to specify dimensions of the roof and height before finalizing the motion. Sara Dechter explained that the Heritage Preservation Officer could work with the applicant to address the conditions and if he felt there was not consensus or that the proposal might not meet the Commission's intent, he could schedule it for a Commission review.

Original Motion

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

6. **REPORTS**

A. **APPROVALS**

Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer, discussed heritage preservation administrative approvals since the last Commission meeting.

1. DKD Town Home
Permit Number(s): BP-18-01616 (-01)
Address: 14 W Dale
Type of Approval: Previously approved demolition
Approval Date: 8/31/2020
2. Shaff Window Replacement
Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00150
Address: 3100 Mount Elden
Type of Approval: Certificate of No Effect for window replacement
Approval Date: 8/31/2020
3. Pizza Hut Demolition
Permit Number(s): BP-20-01747
Address: 4429 N Highway 89
Type of Approval: Demolition permit
Approval Date: 9/4/2020

B. **CONSULTATIONS**

Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer, discussed projects and inquiries about which he has provided heritage preservation guidance and professional advice since the last Commission meeting.

1. Alley art mounting framework in City Right of Way
2. Pelota Court/Basque Handball Court Code Compliance
Address: 50 S San Francisco St.
3. 702 West Birch Ave Compliance
Permit Number(s): PZ-19-00156
Address: 702 W Birch Ave
4. New Duplex & Historic Duplex on Ellery
Permit Number(s): PZ-19-00263-01
Address: 214 E. Ellery Ave
Type of Approval: Design review for compatibility within Southside Historic District
5. Bungalow Court fat 120 W Butler Ave.
Address: 120 E Butler Ave.
Type of Action: Consultation with realtor on property for sale

6. Railyard Lofts
Address: 43 S San Francisco
Type of Action: Consultation on HPC Approved Mitigation
7. SCA Tissue Paper Plant
Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00071-02
Address: 1600 E. Butler Ave
Type of Action: IDS Review of Site development & Demolition
8. Bump Bridge 108 Phoenix Ave ROW
Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00156
Address: 108 W Phoenix Ave (across from 107, Zani)
Type of Action: Ongoing IDS Review
9. Karma Sushi Expansion - into 8 W Route 66
Permit Number(s): BP-20-01082
Address: 8 W Route 66
Type of Action: Monitoring Building Permits
10. IDS Continuing Reviews - Monitoring for any HP impacts
Other Ongoing IDS Reviews:
 - Canyon Del Rio Parcel 1 (PZ-20-00088)
 - Cedar Medical Phase 1 (PZ-20-00151)
 - CIC (PZ-20-00078)
 - DCS Offices (PZ-20-00078)
 - Estates at Pine Canyon (PZ-20-00139)
 - Loven Office (PZ-19-00177-02)
 - Migrant Glass (PZ-20-0019-03)
 - Miramonte At Ponderosa Parkway (PZ-17-00227-09)
 - Oak 24 (PZ-20-00123-01)
 - Rio Homes Unit 4 (PZ-0019-05)
 - Route 66 Auto Plaza (PZ-19-00104-02)

7. **MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS TO/FROM COMMISSION MEMBERS**

1. Chairperson Hayward stated that this case and those related to windows in the Townsite Overlay show that the commission and HPO may need to work on how to improve the Overlays standards, guidelines and implementation in future meetings
2. Sara Dechter asked the commission if they had any feedback on the new method of compiling and distributing the agenda. Feedback was positive
3. Jill Hough stated she had a connectivity issue during Mark Reavis' presentation that meant she could not see the slides. Sara Dechter stated that if that happens in the future to ask the chair for a break so we can send materials and ensure commissioners can follow along.

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Hayward adjourned the meeting by unanimous consent at 6:51 pm.