

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Supervisor Archuleta called the Joint City/County Work Session of March 7, 2016, to order at 4:02 p.m.

The County Board of Supervisors and Flagstaff City Council introduced themselves.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance.

3. Roll Call:

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers/Supervisors may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT

ABSENT

SUPERVISOR ARCHULETA
SUPERVISOR BABBOTT
SUPERVISOR METZGER
SUPERVISOR RYAN

CHAIRWOMAN FOWLER

PRESENT

ABSENT

MAYOR NABOURS
VICE MAYOR BAROTZ
COUNCILMEMBER BREWSTER
COUNCILMEMBER EVANS
COUNCILMEMBER ORAVITS
COUNCILMEMBER OVERTON

COUNCILMEMBER PUTZOVA

Others present: City Manager Josh Copley, County Manager Cynthia Seelhammer

4. Public Participation:

Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an items that are not on the agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment on an item that is on the agenda is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording

clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak.

Pam Clark addressed the Board of Supervisors and the City Council regarding the efforts of the Animal Welfare Task Force to bring to light the issues surrounding animal welfare in Flagstaff. They are currently working to make Flagstaff a no kill City which means that there is a live release rate of 90%.

Diane Jarvis also addressed the Board of Supervisors and the City Council in regards to ending the euthanasia of animals. In order to improve local shelters all agencies must work together and community leaders need to support the various animal agencies in their areas. She requested that a member from the Board of Supervisors and City Council participate on the task force to show their commitment to the efforts.

5. NAIPTA General Update

NAIPTA Director Jeff Meilbeck provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

MOUNTAIN LINE UPDATE AND PLAN
MISSION
VISION & GUIDING PRINCIPLES
PROMISES MADE FY08
PROP, PROMISE, RESULT
FY2016 ACCOMPLISHMENTS
MOUNTAIN LINE – 16 YEARS AND GROWING STRONG
COST PER PASSENGER – FY2008 THRU FY2016
COST PER HOUR – FY2008 THRU FY2016
HOW DO WE COMPARE TO PEERS?
OPERATING EXPENSE PER SERVICE HOUR
OPERATING EXPENSES PER PASSENGER TRIP
LOTS OF LEVERAGE

Mayor Nabours stated that the fares make up 7% of the revenue, the cost per passenger is \$2.37 and the fare is about half of the cost per passenger; he asked why half the revenue is not fares. Mr. Meilbeck explained that the graph includes capital and this year's capital budget is larger than the operating budget. In looking at just operating costs, the percentage of fares that cover the costs of running the bus is 24%. That is still not half because NAIPTA offers a lot of pass programs that are deeply discounted.

Mr. Meilbeck continued his presentation.

PROMISES KEPT, AND...
PROPOSED FLAGSTAFF FIVE-YEAR TRANSIT GROWTH PLAN
VIDEO
CLOSING COMMENTS

Supervisor Metzger asked what costs are included in the bus hour and if the lower price of fuel has changed the ridership levels. Mr. Meilbeck stated that everything is included in the bus hour cost, there may be a small planning grant that is not included but all of the staff time and all of the costs are included. This allows them to identify a baseline and measure against it. In terms

of ridership, the numbers continue to increase and there was an 18% increase in December over last year.

Councilmember Oravits asked if there are any plans for expansion of service or routes. Mr. Meilbeck explained that there is a five year plan that includes having 15 or 20 minute frequency on the high frequency transit spine route. They are looking at reconfiguring the routes again but not so much as an expansion but rather how to better utilize the resources they already have. There are things that they can do with the existing level of transit funding but there are no plans for dramatic shifts unless there was a funding source.

Councilmember Oravits asked if there are any plans for Highway 180 partnership arrangements or service to Twin Arrows. Mr. Meilbeck stated that vanpools have started to Twin Arrows and there is service going to SnowBowl for the first time this year. Additionally, there are vanpools for SnowBowl employees. Transit can be part of the solution but cannot solve all the congestion issues on Highway 180.

Councilmember Brewster asked for further explanation of the rapid bus transfer program. Mr. Meilbeck explained that it is a higher frequency route with more infrastructure and amenities. The idea is that the bus will move more quickly through traffic with things like the dedicated transit lane through campus and construction such as the median transfer stations, or dedicated bus lanes. The plan is to design that in earnest so it is prepared with what it will take to move forward.

Supervisor Babbott stated that he recently discovered that Arizona is one of three states in the country that does not put state funding into public transportation. While talking about a holistic approach to traffic and infrastructure it is apparent that there is inadequate funding provided. With no State funding it is fantastic that the community is still able to see the value and take advantage of such a robust transportation system in Flagstaff.

6. Discussion on snow play in the Flagstaff area.

Flagstaff Interim Recreation Director Rebecca Sayers provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SNOW PLAY DISCUSSION
AGENDA

Ms. Sayers introduced Brian Poturalski with the Forest Service who continued the presentation.

US FOREST SERVICE CURRENT EFFORTS

Flagstaff Convention and Visitor's Bureau Director Trace Ward continued the presentation.

ARIZONA'S WINTER WONDERLAND DESIGNATION
FLAGSTAFF VISITOR CENTER
SNOW PLAY MAP

Mayor Nabours asked what the Visitor Center tells people who call wanting information about coming and playing in the snow. Mr. Ward stated that the Visitor Center staff encourage them to come to Flagstaff and direct them to the webpage with all of the information and options available to them. Staff gives callers options about the different snow play areas and point out the various alternative routes that are available. Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen added

that staff does not discourage callers from coming to Flagstaff but sometimes when it is known that an area is at capacity they share that information with the caller. She added that staff is looking at mobile app options that can provide this information as well.

Mr. Ward continued the presentation.

ADDITIONAL THOUGHTS ON DIVERSIFYING VISITATION DURING SKI SEASON

Supervisor Babbott stated that when the map was made the original intent was primarily an attraction piece; what has been discovered is that in addition to being an attraction piece it should also be very informational in working towards reasonable mitigation strategies. He is appreciative of the thought that is starting to go into re-visioning the map and the information it contains. He wants to make sure to recognize the community attractions but also provide education on how to interact with and treat public lands. Emphasis on respectful behavior, respect of the land and respect of the residents is very much needed. He is looking forward to the re-visioning efforts and discussions.

Councilmember Evans asked for more information about the Northern Arizona Winter Recreation Task Force that was established. She understands that this task force created a strategic plan that included things like utilizing the electronic sign boards on the freeway to let people know when Wing Mountain was full, or when Highway 180 was at its capacity for traffic. There was also something in the plan that discussed the possibility of utilizing the center lane as a lane to get people back into town as well as discussions of actively diverting traffic up Forest. She would like to know more about the plan and more about how it is being implemented.

Ms. Sayers stated that one recommendation will be to reinvigorate the task force as it has been fairly idle for the last few years. The Wing Mountain snow play area was developed out of one of the strategic planning sessions. Councilmember Evans stated that she feels that if all the items in the plan were carried out there may have been some relief on Highway 180 in addition to establishing the Wing Mountain snow play area. She asked if there is sufficient parking at Wing Mountain for the level of activity occurring there. Mr. Poturalski stated that there is not sufficient parking. They can accommodate about 600 cars total at Wing Mountain and that does not come close to meeting the demand. It is time to look at the strategic plan in more depth and that can be done through invigorating the task force.

Councilmember Evans stated that Council gets numerous calls and emails about the trash being left behind at the snow play areas. She asked how that is being addressed. Ms. Sayers offered that work can be done on the messaging to the visitors of Flagstaff for it to be as plain and simple as possible. Staff is currently discussing the strategic placement of dumpsters in high traffic areas to help encourage people to throw away their broken sleds and trash.

Vice Mayor Barotz stated that another concern is the public safety issue of people sledding along the sides of the road on Highway 180 and Lake Mary road. ADOT is aware of the issue but the problem is so big that just that alone will not provide the protection needed.

Councilmember Oravits stated that he is glad that people are coming to Flagstaff and want to enjoy the outdoors. He would like to get messaging out that informs the public about private property; there are many private property owners that are dealing with trash and other issues on their property. He suggested using the digital signs on the highway to tell people to haul out their trash and broken sleds.

Mayor Nabours asked if the forest roads are open to allow people a place to get off the highway

and into the forest to play in the snow. Mr. Poturalski explained that Forest Service roads are closed mainly due to public safety. Many people are parking adjacent to those closed roads to play. Mayor Nabours asked if some of those roads could be open to provide additional snow play opportunities. Mr. Poturalski stated that it could be a possibility and something that can be discussed in the task force. The issues continue to get worse each year and the negative impacts are frustrating for the Forest Service and the community. He is very interested in defining some short and long term efforts to identify mitigation efforts.

Supervisor Archuleta asked about the Winter Wonderland designation and how that was designated. Mr. Ward explained that it is a designation that was given to Flagstaff by the State of Arizona. Supervisor Archuleta offered that it is difficult to have that designation and people come here but are not able to fully enjoy the experience because of the challenges. She is really excited about the idea of a live app with snow play information. She offered that the snow play area map could be expanded to include the ethic and stewardship of the land. More interpretation of what is private land and what is public land would be very helpful. She feels that it is a wonderful start and something that can be built upon every season. She offered that the County would be happy to participate in the development and provide feedback.

Coconino County Assistant Parks and Recreation Director Brian Grube continued the presentation.

SNOWPLAY OPPORTUNITIES AT FORT TUTHILL
SNOWPLAY POSSIBILITIES AT FORT TUTHILL COUNTY PARK
BACKGROUND
SNOWPLAY – PROPOSED SITE
SNOWPLAY CONCEPT AND POSSIBLE ASPECTS
INITIAL PHASE
MID-TERM POSSIBILITIES
LONG-TERM POSSIBILITIES
TIME LINE AND NEXT STEPS

Mayor Nabours asked if the County is looking for someone to charge admission and pay the County or looking for someone that the County will pay to operate the area or if it would be self-supporting based on some kind of concessions. Mr. Grube explained that any of those concepts could be a solution. There may be something that is proposed that is something that has not been thought of. They want to do something similar to the Flagstaff Extreme model. Mayor Nabours asked if an unattended option might work. Mr. Grube stated that Fort Tuthill is very large and it already gets some unattended activity. They feel that a winning combination would be some areas that are fee based activities and some areas that are free. It is a balance that can be negotiated with the proposer.

Supervisor Babbott offered that the RFP is written fairly broadly to see what comes back. With regards to the lighting that was called out it is important to know that the County will be keeping the dark sky designations in mind and how to protect that in the project. Coconino County Parks and Recreation Director Dustin Woodman indicated that the RFP was intentionally drafted with broad language because the County is not in the business of snow play. There is a vision of what the County would like to see but they do not want to be so prescriptive that they eliminate things have not been thought of yet. They will be working with the Board of Supervisors and the City of Flagstaff to make sure the elements fit within the community. The goal is to have something in place by next winter, managed in house so that there is something to add to the map and conversation.

Supervisor Ryan explained that he had the opportunity to serve on the task force and the

recommendations have been enhanced over the years. There were short, mid, and long term objectives; a few of the short term objectives were implemented. The volume that is being experienced in the area is superseding the capacity. There are a lot of trash and bathroom issues that cost money and that is a challenge for each agency. It is good that the task force will be reenergized.

Flagstaff Deputy Police Chief Dan Musselman continued the presentation.

PUBLIC SAFETY AND TRAFFIC MITIGATION

Deputy Chief Musselman explained that by Thanksgiving the City has put up its portable sign at Columbus and Humphreys notifying the public of alternate routes. Additionally, there are permanent signs that direct traffic to alternative routes. Over holiday weekends there are up to five officers directing traffic at key locations to try to move the traffic to the various routes. The three day holiday weekends are the biggest challenges and there are some weekdays also have challenges. ADOT has helped with the timing of the lights on Milton Road to hold traffic on the side streets longer to help move the traffic on the main route. They ran that 23 days and also on the three day weekends. NAIPTA is running routes to SnowBowl but the buses tend to get hung up in the traffic coming back into town. Lastly, ADOT had their electronic signs out reminding the public not to stop and play along the highways.

Chief Deputy Sheriff Jim Driscoll continued stating that the County has implemented things over the years and tried a lot of things. There are a lot of complaints in the Highway 180 corridor of snow play on private lands and all kinds of trash being left there. Property owners were very frustrated and tempers flared as they attempted to have people trespass off their land. The County barricaded nine different roads along Highway 180 and limited that traffic to local traffic only. It worked for the residents but it took the issue and pushed it further down the road. The biggest concern is public safety and traffic citations; experience has found that it is better to educate and move people on then to attempt to ticket everyone. This is a major problem for all the land management and enforcement agencies and if there is a solution it will be a collaborative one. The visitor population increases every year and solutions should focus on education rather than strict enforcement.

Vice Mayor Barotz asked what they see as the next steps that have not yet been taken. Deputy Chief Musselman stated that infrastructure is what is needed. Visitors should be encouraged to come but alternative routes are needed. Also, other play areas as big or bigger than what currently exists are needed. People are going to play wherever they want but having more alternatives would help steer them in the right direction. Vice Mayor Barotz asked if officers are staying over their normal schedule and being paid overtime for their work with snow play traffic to which Deputy Chief Musselman answered yes.

Supervisor Archuleta asked if there has been any discussion about issuing different exit times to people to attempt to have them exit in waves rather than all at once. Chief Deputy Driscoll stated that one of the initial strategies was to have the snow play area close a little bit earlier to stagger the release times. It was somewhat successful but on bad weekends it loaded up anyway.

Councilmember Evans asked who is funding the public safety expenses and the overtime for the officers. Deputy Chief Musselman stated that the Police Department pays for it through their overtime line items that are often exceeded each year. Chief Deputy Driscoll stated that the Sheriff's office has a cooperative agreement with the Forest Service to fund an officer on SnowBowl road to help regulate traffic.

Mayor Nabours left the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

Councilmember Evans stated that she feels a broader conversation could be had with the snow play sites to discuss the funding needed to pay the officers and develop a true partnership to help fund the public safety expenses. Supervisor Babbott offered that the Board of Supervisors considers the impacts to the area when issuing special use permits. He suggested that when Wing Mountain comes up for renewal in 2019 it may be a good time to have that discussion.

Vice Mayor Barotz suggested an update at the next Joint City/County Meeting to let people know the progress being made in terms of the task force and possible strategies.

7. Coconino County and the City of Flagstaff Legislative Update

Coconino County Director of Governmental Relations Todd Medeksza provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

2016 LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES
COUNTY ASSOCIATIONS
ARIZONA STATE LEGISLATURE
BUDGET ACTUAL
COCONINO COUNTY HAS ABSORBED \$7.7 MILLION IN IMPACTS SINCE FY08
2016 COCONINO COUNTY FISCAL PRIORITIES
2016 CSA STATE LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES
OTHERS
QUESTIONS

Assistant to the City Manager Stephanie Smith provided a PowerPoint presentation the covered the following:

CITY OF FLAGSTAFF LEGISLATIVE UPDATE
CITY COUNCIL'S 2016 GUIDING PRINCIPLES
FLAGSTAFF 2016 STATE LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES
 ADVOCATE FOR FUNDING AND BUILDING A SKILLED NURSING FACILITY FOR
 VETERANS IN FLAGSTAFF
 ADVOCATE FOR INVESTING IN FOREST HEALTH TREATMENTS ON
 STATE-OWNED LAND IN THE FLAGSTAFF REGION
 ADVOCATE FOR SECURING AUTHORITY TO PLACE PORTIONS OF THE RED
 GAP RANCH PIPELINE WITHIN INTERSTATE 40 RIGHT-OF-WAY
 ADVOCATE AGAINST FIREARM LEGISLATION THAT WILL ALLOW GUNS IN
 PUBLIC FACILITIES
 ADVOCATE FOR REFORMING STATE PENSION SYSTEMS TO OBTAIN GREATER
 FLEXABILITY IN MANAGING PENSION PLANS AFFECTING MUNICIPAL
 EMPLOYEES
 STATEWIDE ISSUES IMPORTANT TO FLAGSTAFF
FLAGSTAFF 2016 FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES
 ADVOCATE FOR INCREASED AUTHORIZATION AND FUNDING THE RIO DE FLAG
 FLOOD CONTROL PROJECT
 ADVOCATE FOR FLAGSTAFF WATERSHED PROTECTION PROJECT AND
 FUNDING FOR IMPORTANT REGIONAL PROJECTS
 ADVOCATE FOR RELEASING THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S REVISIONARY
 INTEREST ON PROPERTY SOLD TO THE CITY BY THE BNSF RAILROAD
 FLAGSTAFF PROJECTS AND LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES

Councilmember Oravits left meeting at 6:20 p.m.

Flagstaff's contract Lobbyist Richard Travis provided a brief update on the pawnbroker fee bill, two fireworks bills and the gun issue bill.

8. Informational Items To/From Chairman, Supervisors and County Manager/Mayor, Council and City Manager.

Ms. Seelhammer congratulated the City on their excellent selection of Public Works Director. She also announced that the County celebrated its 125th anniversary last Thursday and there will be a variety of events coming up to that regard. Additionally, the County is more than half way through training its staff on situational awareness and active shooter training.

Mr. Copley announced that City staff has also been receiving active shooter training and situational awareness and he is eager to collaborate with the County to that regard.

The Board of Supervisors and Councilmembers all thanked each other for participating in the joint meeting and they thanked staff for the work put into the presentations.

Supervisor Ryan wished Andy Bertelsen well as he transitions from the County to the City. He also thanked Supervisor Babbott for his concluding service as Chairman.

Supervisor Babbott stated that he would like the City and County to reconvene on snow play to get an update when the map is reworked. He also reported that the County will be going through some zoning code updates similar to those that the City recently did.

Supervisor Archuleta stated that as each agency moves forward on their legislative items it would be good to coordinate any messaging.

9. Public Participation

None

10. Adjournment

The Flagstaff City Council/Coconino Board of Supervisors Joint Work Session of March 7, 2016, adjourned at 6:31 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK