## **MINUTES**

COMBINED WORK SESSION/SPECIAL MEETING TUESDAY, JANUARY 14, 2014 COUNCIL CHAMBERS 211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE 6:00 P.M.

## **WORK SESSION**

#### 1. Call to Order.

Mayor Nabours called the Flagstaff City Council Combined Work Session/Special Meeting of January 14, 2014, to order at 6:10 p.m.

#### 2. Roll Call

## **Councilmembers present:**

Councilmembers absent:

MAYOR NABOURS
VICE MAYOR EVANS
COUNCILMEMBER BAROTZ
COUNCILMEMBER BREWSTER
COUNCILMEMBER ORAVITS
COUNCILMEMBER OVERTON
COUNCILMEMBER WOODSON

Others present: City Manager Kevin Burke; City Attorney Michelle D'Andrea

## 3. Pledge of Allegiance

The City Council and audience recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### 4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Michelle Thomas, Flagstaff, reminded Council and staff of a previous request by a Councilmember to ensure that the agenda items were listed in layman's terms.

Michael Dugan, Flagstaff, said that he heard they were looking at revisiting the panhandling ordinance and it has been his experience that there are a lot more people in need and some are getting pretty aggressive. He appreciated that review.

# 5. Preliminary Review of Draft Agenda for the January 21, 2014, City Council Meeting.\*

\* Public comment on draft agenda items may be taken under "Review of Draft Agenda Items" later in the meeting, at the discretion of the Mayor. Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council for discussion under the second Review section may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

Vice Mayor Evans, with regard to Possible Future Agenda Items (B), said that she was more interested in a Displacement Policy or ordinance and asked that the wording be changed for the final agenda.

Mr. Burke noted, as well, that item 10-D's heading was not very clear and they would clarify its language for the final agenda. He explained that it was a resolution memorializing the property inventory of the discussions made at their previous meeting.

Councilmember Barotz asked that the prior resolution referenced in the Gore item be included in the final agenda packet.

Councilmember Woodson said that Item 10-D was a great example of someone in the public reading the agenda and not understanding what it was dealing with.

With regard to 13-A, Gore Pre-annexation Agreement, Councilmember Woodson asked if they could get a clearer map showing the current city limits.

## 6. Flagstaff Cultural Partners Annual Report

Community Design and Redevelopment Manager Karl Eberhard introduced John Tannous, Executive Director of Flagstaff Cultural Partners.

Mr. Tannous gave a PowerPoint presentation which reviewed the following:

- ANNUAL REPORT
- MISSION
- •FCP / CITY AGREEMENT

#### •#1 ACTIVITIES/EVENTS

Summer Night on the Square
Art Box Incubator
Flagstaff365.com
Received \$10,000 grant to get the word out
Active Partnerships
Support Services

## •#2 EXPAND THE ROLE OF ARTS, CULTURE, SCIENCE

Grant Projects Completed Coconino Center for the Arts

- •#3 INCREASE PARTICIPATION OPPORTIES FOR RESIDENTS
- •#4 GRANTS FOR CITY'S BBB TAX REVENUES
- •RETURN ON INVESTMENT
- •ROI: LOCAL TAX REVENUE
- •ROI: TOURISM REVENUE
- •NEW FOR 2014

Online Grant Application New Website and Brand Tion Mion: Memento Mori Art Box Institute 2014 Viola Awards

Mayor Nabours said that he is often asked where the City's BBB money goes, and the Flagstaff Cultural Partners is one example. Mr. Tannous said that their operating budget is flanked by a variety of revenue sources such as grants, the community, etc., including the City's BBB tax. He said that the City's BBB tax gives them what they need to provide services, including the grants that go out to local service providers.

Councilmember Brewster thanked Mr. Tannous for his comprehensive presentation. With regard to Return on Investment, she said that a year or two ago someone did a study from NAU that showed people coming to Flagstaff for the arts stay longer and spend more than other events.

## 7. Review of Draft Agenda Items for the January 21, 2014, City Council Meeting.\*

\* Public comment on draft agenda items will be taken at this time, at the discretion of the Mayor.

None

#### 8. **Public Participation**

None

#### 9. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager.

Vice Mayor Evans said that she heard from the Good Neighbor Group that an e-mail they had sent out to her had bounced back, and asked that staff look into the issue.

#### 10. **Adjournment**

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held January 14, 2014, adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

# **SPECIAL MEETING**

## 1. Call to Order

Mayor Nabours called the Special Meeting of January 14, 2014, to order at 6:30 p.m.

Mayor Nabours said that if they were going to have this on the May ballot then this week Council needs to approve the Regional Plan and vote to put it on the ballot. He said that comments made should be specific to the paragraph. It can be amended tonight, but this is it.

## 2. Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030: Place Matters

A. <u>Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2014-01:</u> A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council adopting the *Flagstaff Area Regional Plan 2030 Place Matters* as the general plan for the City of Flagstaff.

Regional Plan Project Manager Jim Cronk gave a brief PowerPoint which addressed:

- **•UPDATING/AMENDING THE REGIONAL PLAN**
- •MAP THE REGIONAL PLAN AREA
- •REGIONAL PLAN PROVIDES CHOICE
- •THE REGIONAL PLAN VISION
- •HOW THE COMMUNITY ARRIVED AT THIS POINT
- •IT'S BEEN A LONG JOURNEY
- •COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT ALL MEETINGS WERE OPEN TO PUBLIC
- PUBLIC MEETINGS CITY AND COUNTY
- •SOME LAST MINUTE CLERICAL CHANGES

Mr. Cronk thanked Jennifer, Roger, Michelle and James, as well as others, on staff for their work. He noted that a new resolution had been prepared to change the word "commission" to "committee."

Councilmember Brewster thanked Mr. Cronk for his years of service with the City and particularly on this project, and she hoped he enjoyed his retirement.

The following individuals spoke in support of the Regional Plan:

- Maral Moffitt
- William Grafton
- Gabor Kovacs

The following comments were received:

- •Thanked everyone; appreciated that they listened to all the people to make it something they can all get behind.
- •Supports the changes that Council has recommended; hopes they support a May election

Paul Shankland, Director of the Naval Observatory, brought forward concerns related to the Dark Sky section of the Regional Plan. He said that his concern was with the removal of language that the Citizens Advisory Committee had put in regarding urbanization. By removing that language, they risk the essence of the national security mission.

Additionally, he said that the impact of what they do at the Naval Observatory includes high visibility standing in the STEM community, with the recent approval of \$5.6 million to begin installation of the interferometer.

After brief discussion, Mayor Nabours said that he did not think there was any issue with the Council understanding the importance of the Observatory. Councilmember Barotz said that there seemed to be some confusion with the distinction between land use and lighting.

Mr. Shankland said that they did not have a concern with the overall intent; it was the subtle impacts that may occur with removal of that language.

Jeff Hall with Lowell Observatory said that there was another statement that had been removed, which was on Page IV-13 noting that they would "enforce the Dark Sky Ordinance." He said that while it may see self-evident, it was important for the City to be intentional. He said that it was not just any ordinance, but rather a leading ordinance worldwide.

Chris Luginbuhl with the Naval Observatory said that he wanted to underscore the relationship between: 1) the Dark Sky Ordinance; 2) land use policies and how the City develops; and 3) how they implement both of those plans.

He said that they understand the planning principle, but the appropriate place for urbanization is not next to observatories.

After further discussion and various suggestions, Council agreed to have something written up during the break to be brought back for further consideration.

The following individuals then addressed the Council:

- •Lance Diskan
- Maury Herman
- Charlotte Welch

The following comments were received:

- •Came to the community because of the dark skies
- Some on Council want to change the direction from that of the past
- •Requested that wording be balanced on the issue of public streets needed for public events and enterprises around an impacted area, with residential parking ordinances.

After brief discussion it was suggested that proposed wording be developed during the break and brought back for further discussion.

At this time a break was held from 7:36 p.m. to 7:54 p.m.

The following individuals address the Council:

- David Monihan
- Karen Bradford
- Jeff Knorr
- Carol Kendall
- Moran Henn
- •Mike Sistak, Chamber of Commerce
- Charlie Odegaard
- Joy Staveley
- Michael Dugan
- Richard Mihalilk
- Gaylord Staveley
- Roger Boone
- •Bill McCullough

The following comments were received:

- •Let's have an election
- •Regarding Dark Sky Ordinance, does not want to go with original language; it was flawed; likes Councilwoman Barotz' language
- •Likes Vice Mayor Evan's ranking of resident, business, demand for parking issues in residential/downtown areas
- •Thanked the Council for listening to everyone and asked that it be approved as amended
- •Supports amended version; doesn't agree with all language but realizes a document of this size will not please everyone
- •If they have screened parking and alleys, they are inviting more crime
- •Fells like many edits were not very well thought through; concerned that final edits have weakened the Plan, the process and its vision

FFF prioritized compact development over urban sprawl and they feel that has been abandoned

- •Between now and May they will compare the current Plan and proposed Plan
- •In Backpacking Magazine, Flagstaff was #4 in Best Cities to Raise an Outdoor Kid Believes this Regional Plan will not change that
- •The Citizens Advisory Committee was not balanced enough and was an advisory committee to the Council
- •The Final Plan has been reviewed from a more general, broad brush.
- •Hope it will be a unanimous vote

Councilmember Barotz said that this plan will only have meaning and value if staff and the community are committed to the goals. She has put together a list of changes, two of which have already been addressed through the Dark Sky discussion.

Vice Mayor Evans said that early on in their review of the plan there was an introduction section which recognized the various organizations and associations that had received information and/or given input on the plan and at that time the Tea Party requested that their name be removed from the document. She said that she has thought about this over the weekend and she believes that to remove their name from the list was disingenuous and she asked that the Council consider putting their name back into the list.

A break was held from 8:27 p.m. to 8:45 p.m.

After further discussion, Council agreed to the following amendments:

1) Page IX-44 to read:

<u>Policy LU. 12.11</u> – Develop a residential parking program to address the impacts of on-street parking on public streets in the downtown and surrounding areas while considering the needs of residents, public events, and enterprises in and around the impacted areas.

2) Page IV-13 of CAC Draft – Council deleted Policy E&C.5.3. Put into final document to read:

Policy E&C.5.3. – Continue to enforce dark sky ordinances.

3) Page IV-13 add to read:

<u>Policy E&C 5.4</u> – Encourage uses within Lighting Zone I of the lighting codes of the City and County that do not require outdoor lighting, and discourage those which require all-night lighting.

4) Page II-8 to read:

People who live and work in the area see the cumulative effects of the region's growth. For many, growth is seen as positive for the expansion of economic, educational, cultural and medical opportunities, while for others growth is increasingly being associated with negative impacts such as traffic congestion, air and water pollution, loss of open space and traditional agricultural uses, housing choices for the work force, and loss of the "small town feel." While it is true that there are different community perceptions toward growth, this plan realizes that growth is probable and good for our economy and overall community prosperity; therefore, we must acknowledge the following challenges we must face in accommodating this growth.

5) Page IV-12 to read:

For the purposes of the Flagstaff Regional Plan, how we develop land will have an impact on our reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and mitigation of climate change.

6) Page IV-12 of Council Edited Draft, to read:

<u>Policy E&C.2.1</u> – Encourage the reduction of all energy consumption, especially fossil fuel generated energy, in public, commercial, industrial, and residential sectors.

7) Page IV-12 of CAC Draft Council deleted policy; pub back into Council Edited Plan, to read:

<u>Policy E&C.2.2.</u> – Promote investments that strengthen climate resiliency.

8) Page IX-31 of Council edited draft, to read:

<u>Policy LU.5.1.</u> – Encourage development patterns within the designated growth boundaries to sustain efficient infrastructure projects and maintenance.

9) Page IX-54 of CAC Draft previously deleted; include in Final Draft on IX-68 to read:

Adopt traffic regulations to increase awareness of pedestrian oriented design for activity centers.

10) Page IX-54 of CAC Draft, to read:

Plan activity centers and corridors appropriate to their respective regional or neighborhood scale.

11) Page XIV-11, remove Policy ED.6.3. (rodeo).

Vice Mayor Evans moved to include Tea Party to the list at the beginning of the document, not letting them opt out; motion failed due to lack of a second.

Mayor Nabours said that he would like to see adoption of the Plan get a unanimous vote. This plan would be considerably different if he wrote it himself, but that is not how it is done. They are there to come to some type of consensus.

Councilmember Barotz said that when they engage in the process again she would hope they would learn from the present, and make the expectations clear to the group drafting the plan as to what it would look like, and that the Council will be reviewing and may possibly rewrite portions.

Councilmember Brewster thanked the CAC members for all of their hard work, and to staff and City Manager for bringing it together.

Councilmember Oravits said that it had been a long process and he thanked everyone involved. He had tons of concerns with the draft and heard from a lot of constituents, and a lot of those concerns were addressed. There were areas that he did not like, but he realized there has to be some compromise.

Councilmember Woodson thanked everyone for their many hours and said it was much appreciated. He said that he hoped the community supports it as the Council does.

Vice Mayor Evans thanked the members of the CAC; she personally appreciated their commitment and was humbled by that commitment and their time. She thanked Kimberly Sharp, Roger, Jim, and Jennifer, and everyone else involved. She said that while they may have a debate over who was involved, a large majority of the citizens managed to be engaged.

Councilmember Overton said that he was proud of the document and thinks the decision makers use it to the best of their ability. He said that the Council engaged in the process to read it, understand it, and provide some accomplishments within the document. He thought it was a responsibility that the Council heard from everyone. He hoped they can send it to the voters knowing that not only did they take citizen input, public hearings, staff, etc., but that the Council endorses it as seven different members and he really implored all of them to support it.

Councilmember Barotz moved to read Resolution No. 2014-01 by title only, as amended this evening; seconded; passed unanimously.

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF ADOPTING THE FLAGSTAFF AREA REGIONAL PLAN 2030 PLACE MATTERS AS THE GENERAL PLAN FOR THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF

Councilmember Barotz moved to adopt Resolution No. 2014-01 as amended; seconded; passed unanimously.

Mr. Cronk said that this was his last Council meeting after 42 years in public service. The Mayor and Council thanked him for everything he has done for the City and for his leadership.

Mr. Cronk thanked the Mayor and Council for everything they have done; Kevin Burke for his leadership and Mark Landsiedel for the opportunity he was given to work for Flagstaff. He said that the civil discourse, support and respect from Council that has been felt by staff has made their job easier.

At this time, Mr. Cronk presented the Mayor and Council with the framed original artwork of the cover of the Regional Plan, by artist Bruce Aiken.

B. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2014-02: A resolution of the Council of the City of Flagstaff, Arizona ordering and calling a Special Election in and for the City of Flagstaff to submit to the qualified electors thereof a question with respect to ratification of the adoption of the Flagstaff Area Regional Plan 2030: Place Matters as the new general plan for the City of Flagstaff

City Clerk Elizabeth Burke briefly reviewed the resolution which had been presented for consideration, should the Council wish to move forward with a May election.

Councilmember Woodson moved to read Resolution No. 2014-02 by title only; seconded; passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, ARIZONA, ORDERING AND CALLING A SPECIAL ELECTION IN AND FOR THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, ARIZONA, TO SUBMIT TO THE QUALIFIED ELECTORS THEREOF A QUESTION WITH RESPECT TO RATIFICATION OF THE ADOPTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF AREA REGIONAL PLAN 2030: PLACE MATTERS AS THE NEW GENERAL PLAN FOR THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF

Councilmember Overton moved to adopt Resolution No. 2014-02; seconded; passed unanimously.

## 3. Adjournment

The Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council of January 14, 2014, adjourned at 9:35 p.m.

ATTEST:	′OR
CITY CLERK	
CERTIFICATION	
STATE OF ARIZONA) ss.) County of Coconino )	
I, ELIZABETH A. BURKE, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held January 14, 2014. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.	
Dated this 4th day of February, 2014.	

CITY CLERK